Ecological Assessment and Culturally Responsive Practice in the Schools

Felicia Castro-Villarreal, Ph.D., LSSP
Victor Villarreal, Ph.D., LP, LSSP
The University of Texas at San Antonio

Outline

I. Demographics of students in U.S. school
II. Call for effective practice with CLD students
III. Current State of Research
   I. Implications for researchers
   II. Implications for trainers
IV. Implications for practitioners
V. Culturally responsive practices

CLD students in the U.S.
CLD Students in the U.S.

- English Language Learners
  - Higher in 2010-11 than in 2002-03 (Aud et al., 2013)
- Student living in poverty
  - Approximately 21% of school-age children in the United States are from families living in poverty (Aud et al., 2013)

CLD Students and Educational Outcomes

- Racial minority youth perform significantly lower and have greater high school dropout rates (Aud et al., 2013; National Center for Education Statistics, 2013)
- ELL students attain the lowest academic achievement scores of all public school students (Aud et al., 2013)
- Family income has been consistently demonstrated as being related to school achievement (Durán, M., & Rodíguez, 2011)
CLD Students and Long-Term Outcomes

- Negative long-term outcomes...
  - African American and Hispanic youth have lower levels of educational attainment (Aud et al., 2013)
  - Lower employment rates/lower annual earnings in adulthood
  - High school drop out status associated with higher levels of involvement with the criminal justice and welfare systems

Meeting the Diverse Needs of CLD Students and Schools: Research and Training
Meetings Diverse Needs: Professional Guidelines

- NASP model of practice states that school psychologists should have knowledge of principles and of research-based strategies to enhance services for diverse children, families, and schools (NASP, 2010)

Meeting Diverse Needs: Professional Guidelines

- The APA general principles state that psychologists must be aware of and respect the differences of others, including those based on race, ethnicity, culture, language, and socioeconomic status (American Psychological Association, 2010)

Meeting Diverse Needs Through Research

- APA specifically stresses the importance of conducting psychological research among persons from diverse backgrounds (APA, 2003)

- Not incorporating CLD samples into studies creates external validity problems (Sue, 1999)
Are CLD variables a nuisance?

Meeting Diverse Needs Through Research

- Few evidence-based practices are available for use with CLD students (Ingraham & Oka, 2006)
- Researchers should clearly identify the locations and populations of participants to which results may be generalized (Gersten et al., 2005; Horner et al., 2006)
- Researchers should document sample comparability to account for the possibility that study effects were due to preexisting differences (Sanson et al., 2005)
- Disaggregating data is important in examination of outcomes – comparing subgroups may yield different outcomes patterns (Allison & Upah, 2001)
CLD Representation in School Psychology Research

- School psychologists appear to understand the need to incorporate issues of diversity into research methodologies and practice.
- CLD representation in school psychology journals

Weise (1992)
- 1975-1990
- 9% percent of the articles focused on diversity-related issues/diverse samples
- 87% primarily focused on assessment.

Miranda and Gutter (2002)
- 1990-1999
- 10.6% of the articles reviewed included diversity-related content
- 13% were intervention focused

- 2000-2003
- 16.9% of the articles reviewed were diversity-related
- 22% of these articles focused on intervention or prevention
- 20.4% focused on assessment

Albers, Hoffman, and Lundahl (2009)
- Focus on ELLs
- 6.5% of the articles covered issues related to ELL students
- Assessment was the focus of 55.9% of the articles
- 20.3% were focused on intervention

Noltemeyer, Proctor, and Dempsey (2013)
- 2008-2010
- 9.2% of the school psychology journal articles addressed issues of race/ethnicity as a topic
Intervention Research in School Psychology

- Bliss, Skinner, Hautau, and Carroll (2008) found that only 8% of articles from 2000-2005 represented causal-experimental research.
- Villarreal et al. (2013) found that only 10.5% of articles from 2005-2009 represented intervention studies with school-age youth.

CLD Representation in School Psychology

- CLD students are underrepresented in school psychology journal articles, and the general lack of published practice research suggests possible underrepresentation in this area as well.
- Consequently, potential underrepresentation may be associated with the previously noted risks to external validity whereby results of practices may not generalize to CLD student groups.

CLD Representation in School Psychology Intervention Research

- Allows for implications that directly relate to the increasingly common call for the utilization of evidence-based treatments and practices with all children, including those of diverse backgrounds.
Variables to explore...
- Basic demographic variables
- Comparison of groups
- Samples
- Outcomes

Racial/Ethnic Group Status
- Race/ethnicity and geographic region are most often reported in intervention journal articles
- Approximately 78% of articles for both cases
- Hispanic students are currently underrepresented in intervention research
- Hispanic students now represent ~1/4 of all students in public schools but only represented approximately one-eighth of those in the intervention studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Racial/Ethnic Group</th>
<th>% of Total Articles</th>
<th>Average % of Sample Participants per Each Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>65.9</td>
<td>55.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black or African American</td>
<td>54.1</td>
<td>26.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>56.5</td>
<td>13.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian or Pacific Islander</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian and Alaska Native</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiracial</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Only 28% of the articles reported specific information about the economic status of study samples. In 2011, approximately 21% of school-age children in the United States were from families living in poverty (Aud et al., 2013). ELL status information was only reported in 15% of the articles. In 2011, approximately 10% of students in public schools in the U.S. were identified as ELL (Aud et al., 2013).
Comparisons of Groups Within CLD Categories

- Race/ethnicity: 14.1%
- SES: 9.4%
- ELL: 1.2%

Variables associated with CLD not being utilized in a meaningful way
- CLD variables used as "nuisance variables" rather than as central contextual variables (American Psychological Association, 2003)
- Study results/discussions based on restricted populations
- Lack of exploration of possibility that some aspects of behavior/functioning may be explained by CLD variables

Implications for Researchers

- Critical that researchers provide enough information about participants so that readers can identify the population of participants to which results may be generalized (Gersten et al., 2005)
- Avoid treating CLD participant status as a nuisance variable (American Psychological Association, 2003)
  - (a) document sample comparability
  - (b) examine potential differences in outcomes results for students of different CLD groups

Implications for Trainers

- Limitations relevant for discussion in courses that stress:
  - Individual and group differences
  - Behavioral/academic interventions or assessment
  - Provision of psychological services in culturally responsive and competent manners.
- Encourage students to critically examine research methodologies
  - Especially those presenting practices they may use

Purposefully encourage the development of abilities to adapt practices in culturally responsive ways
Comparison of sample articles

- Article 1
- Article 2

Implications for Practitioners...

Meeting the Diverse Needs of CLD Students and Schools: Practice
Meetings Diverse Needs Through Practice

- NASP model of practice states that school psychologists should have knowledge of principles and of research related evidence-based strategies to enhance services for diverse children, families, and schools (NASP, 2010).

Moving away from research...

- How to incorporate practices of ecological and culturally responsive models
- How to adapt problem solving model
- Ways to adapt interventions and curricular materials in meaningful ways toward culturally responsive practices

Moving away from research...

- One size fits all problem
- Considering the aforementioned, how should practitioners move forward for working with culturally and linguistically diverse persons and the advancement of culturally responsive practices?
- How should we apply evidence based methods with culturally and linguistically diverse persons?
- Are there ecologically valid methods for modifying what exists?
Important Concepts

- Culturally Competent
- Sensitive
- Responsive
- Centered
- Cultural Competence
  - NASP defines as a set of congruent behaviors, attitudes, and policies that come together to work effectively in cross-cultural situations
- Competence vs. Responsiveness
- Culturally Centered
  - Coined to recognize that all individuals, including psychologists are influenced by different contexts
- These terms vary in terms of intensity but each consider culture and language related issues

Important Concepts

- What is culturally responsive practice? Conscious and meaningful consideration of cultural and linguistic variables that may bear on children’s functioning.
- Cultural values, beliefs, & traditions
- Language spoken at home
- Bilingualism
- Record review for assessment of language proficiency
- Interviewing students and understanding social group, socio-cultural background
- Research on learning styles, differences, and motivation
- Ecologically valid assessment: you must take care to ensure selected instruments are applicable for use with the population at hand
- Evaluation of instructional programs for appropriateness
- Evaluation of students in comparison to “true peers”

Prerequisites for Culturally Responsive Practice

- Motivation and Commitment
  - Research on school psychologists (Sullivan & A’Vant, 2009)
- Informed knowledge base
  - Gaps in the research, new emerging findings
  - Research on school psychologists (Sullivan & A’Vant, 2009)
- Sensitivity for and awareness of differences
What now?

- Why adapt?
  - The reasonable alternative is to ADAPT, modify, or tailor EBIs.
- What is adaptation?
  - The process of modifying key characteristics of an intervention without competing with or contradicting the essential elements.
  - These critical or core features must be maintained to advance EBI practice and to generalize for use with CL populations.

Cautions in Adaptation

- In the case of Intervention:
  - The adaptation should retain the essence.
  - The unique characteristics of the population being should be considered.
  - All while keeping the essence of the EBIs.
  - Hard balance and can be challenging to balance integrity with adaptation.

Cultural Adaptation

The systematic modification of an EBT or intervention protocol to consider language, culture, and context in such a way that is compatible with the client’s cultural patterns, meanings, and values.

(Bernal, Bonilla, & Bellido, 1995)
Frameworks for Culturally Adapting Interventions

Why Adapt?
- Specificity
  - Treatments should be individualized
  - Three common constructs found to differentiate ethnic minorities from majority groups
    - Inter-dependence, spirituality, and discrimination
- External Validity
  - Most EBI are conducted with upper class white

Why Adapt?
- Evidentiary Argument
  - Empirical differences between the symptoms and disorders by race and ethnicity so failure to take these into account will result in more errors
  - Ethnic match associated with retention and engagement
  - Little research to show that EBI are effective with minorities
  - Studies on risk taking behavior, help seeking behavior, and health beliefs
- Feasibility and practicality
  - Demographics
  - Engagement
  - Sustainability
  - Relevance
Four Models
- Ecological Validity Model
  - (Bernal, Bonilla, & Bellido, 1995)
- Ecological Validity plus Process (OP)
  - (Domenech-Rodriguez & Weiling, 2004)
- Psychotherapy adaptation and modification framework (PAMF)
  - (Hwang, 2006)
- Guide to Program Fidelity and Adaptation
  - (Backer, 2001)

Ecological Validity Model
Bernal, Bonilla, & Bellido, 1995

- Originally conceptualized for Latino populations
- Ecological Validity Model
  - (Bernal, Bonilla, & Bellido, 1995)
- Systematic framework for adapting EBIs
- 8 essential features to adapt and modify
Ecological Validity Model
(Bernal, Bonilla, & Bellido, 1995)

- Language
- Persons
- Metaphor
- Content
- Concepts
- Goals
- Methods
- Context

How to Adapt: The Ecological Validity Model in Practice

- Adaptation of each element in Practice
- Element by Element
  - Do students understand the language and idioms used?
  - Language
    - Bilingual Approach
    - Translate to native L1
    - Flexibility for code switching
    - Local dialects

Persons

- Do students identify with the persons, characters, and individuals?
- Persons can be characters in materials
- Persons can be those implementing the intervention as in ethnic matching in counseling and supervision. Are the students or consultee comfortable with the similarity (or difference) in the ethnic background of the consultant or school specialist?
- Example: UTHSC made it a point to recruit a person already a teacher at the selected school and who was of similar ethnic background to teach the curriculum
Metaphor

- Do the materials include any metaphors, examples, or symbols that are culturally bound or insensitive?
- Can also adapt examples, materials, content so that it resonates with the population at hand.
- It important that the implementer have experience with the population and similar populations to provide rich and authentic examples that students can relate with.
- Example: Symbols and culturally bound concepts. Consider sociocultural context and the influence of technology (OMG, SMH, ;\m/\, ;') are these symbols part of and accepted in the intervention?

Content

- Examine the content for cultural, linguistic, social, regional specificity
- Cultural knowledge, values, traditions, and uniqueness of groups
- Can alter content to include ethnically similar characters but not enough must examine content for cultural sensitivity and appropriateness
- Must critically examine language, examples, metaphors, characters
- In essence, when examining content and determining if items need to be altered the previous areas need to be examined.
- Must ask; How would a student respond to this content? What is the idea of familismo, respect, gender roles, interdependence?
- Consider incorporating these ideas when working with minority groups. That is, involve extended family members, make service to others part of the system, affirm and validate students commitment and feelings of obligation to family.
- Example: CBM materials based on literacy curriculum but adapted and translated to Spanish

Concepts

- Treatment concepts must jive with culture and context, i.e., dependence vs. independence
- Is the student or consultant in agreement with the definition of a problem? In consultation, philosophical differences is often a source of resistance, deficit models, do consultees agree with this approach to service delivery?
- Example: Continuing to live with family beyond a certain age, refusing to go away for college, is the students perspective on this considered in concept?
Goals
- Are the goals consistent with the culture?
- Transmission of positive adaptive cultural values, support of adaptive values of the culture
- Make sure that goals are in line with cultural aspirations
- Make sure alignment with cultural norms
- Make sure for appropriate reasons
- Must be sensitive in this regard
- Example: Many high risk urban high schools offer vocational type training to align with familial and financial goals of this population.
- More interestingly the 4th graders were actually more flexible in monitoring attendance goals. The average attendance rate for the class was 85% but for the 20% of the class who were most at-risk, students with the best attendance missed one day per week to eligibility for field trips and other attendance contingencies were based on their own baseline and one absence a week was allowed.
- Example: Are goals consonant with cultural expectations?
- Does the student agree with goals? This is particularly important when developing IEP and related service counseling goals, this can be particularly important when counseling with students.

Methods
- Methods
- Reading and literacy
- Repeated reading approaches
- PALS
- HELPS
- Must look at competition as a variable, must look at cultural and ethnic factors in this process.
- Bridge between literacy materials/content and the world in which students live
- Thus, patterns of interaction, conversations, engagement, relationships, have to be considered
- Level of parental involvement, type of parental involvement, might have to dictate your standard book list and ask parents to review or sample materials for cultural appropriateness which in addition to involvement will facilitate buy in and authenticity
- Levels of involvement that would use authentic materials not just standard commercially available materials
- Aware of extended family involvement, might require one adapted method as a read along with cousins, tia, or grandparents

Context
- Consider the time and place
- Who and what is available?
- Consider constraints
- Consider school culture & climate
- Consider family dynamics
- Social context
- Consider the larger Ecosystem for Ecological Valid practice
Some Research on Effectiveness

- Matos et al., 2006
  - PCIT: Modified Time-out procedure for children who actively refused or required excessive force and instead incorporated loss of privileges
  - Extended the session duration
  - Incorporated discussion on extended family participation in child-rearing process
- Kohn, et al., 2002
  - Use of closed group to facilitate cohesion
  - Added 4 culturally specific sections of content: healthy relationships, spirituality-religiosity, African American Family Issues, African American female identity

Research

- McCabe et al., 2005
  - PCIT: reframe program as educational vs. therapeutic (teacher/expert vs. therapists, program name-GANA-Guiando a ninos activos)
  - Comprehensive engagement protocol- incorporated extended family members, removal of barriers to treatment
- Rossello & Bernal, 2006
  - UBT, TEPSI: Familismo and cultural values of absolute parental authority and respect
  - Additional meeting with parents
  - Addressing positive aspects of familismo value
  - Address acceptable balance between dependence, interdependence, and independence
  - Consultant/student/consultee match

What it Looks Like in Practice

Applications of the Ecological Validity Framework
Castro-Villarreal and colleagues conducted action research in an urban culturally and linguistically diverse HS setting. Consultee-centered consultation with teachers of 8 teachers in an CL diverse school serving approximately 200 students.

Method:
- Structured pre/post interviews, cross validated with survey responses on consultee satisfaction, client/student outcomes, and teaching efficacy.
- Observations
- Single-case design data to measure outcomes

Ecological Validity Model
- Adapted for work with CL population
- Kept the essence of the behavioral problem solving model but modified some areas to resonate with consultees working in high risk setting.
- Found this to be critical to buy-in and establishing trust and rapport.

Globally:
- Getting to know the Territory or Pre-entry phase
- Non-hierarchical structure
- Microcounseling skills
- Slowing down the model
- Solution focused vs. Problem focused

Behavioral Problem Solving Model: Adaptation at Each Concept
- Language: All consultees were English speakers, however, language preference was assessed in interviews with consultees and language was mirrored often utilizing a bilingual "tejano" approach/slang, microcounseling skills were critical here.
- Personal: Similar ethnic background and ethnically diverse consultees, openly discussed background with consultees and students. Ethnic matching was noted.
- Metaphors: Through case notes examination, very closely reflected on case notes for metaphorical differences.
- Content: Modified the problem focused approach toward a more "solution seeking" approach and consultee-centered approach. Language and common terms were modified in a move away from a problem focused approach.
Behavioral Problem Solving Model: Adaptation at Each Concept

- **Concepts**: Language was modified and examined via transcript and case note reviews.
- **Goals**: Goals were co-constructed consistent with a consultee-centered approach. Collaboration was emphasized and reflected on daily via case notes and transcripts.
- **Method**: Allowed consultees to move flexibly through the stages and to “slow down” the model spending as much time as necessary in the getting to know the territory phase. Made extensive use of microcounseling skills and attended to the process, interaction, and relationship between consultant and consultee.
- **Context**: Valued the context, affirmed and validated feelings, emotions, fears, anxieties. Did a whole lot of Listening by learning from the previous two semesters.

---

Applying the Framework to Literacy Instruction

Culturally Responsive Literacy Instruction

What it Looks Like in Practice: Adaptations to Literacy Instruction

- Literacy Instruction and EBIs for ELLs is scarce.
- Thus, we also need tools for adapting literacy instruction with ELLs.
Foundations for CR Practice: The Culturally Responsive Literacy Model

- Foundational principles or common factor across
- Direct and explicit instruction
- Small groups
- Multiple opportunities to respond
- Multiple opportunities to practice
- Feedback
- Explicit instruction in all areas of reading
- Groups should be small and homogeneous
- Instructional delivery

How to incorporate these foundations into our work and consultation in the schools

- Consider Content
- Persons: Must consider the importance of the teacher in terms of experience, quality, and ethnic/cultural background
- “solution seeking approach” where we build on student’s strengths to develop interventions
- Culturally responsive literacy instruction aims to bridge the gap between reading and the world/cultures students live in
- Content: literature that focuses on people of color, religious minorities, the disabled
- Multicultural literature that is outside the literary canon or recommended book lists encourages participation from diverse groups
Some Literacy programs

- Other Culturally responsive literacy programs for ELLs
  - Tier 1: ExC-ELL: Expediting Comprehension for ELL (K-12)
  - Tier II: RIGOR: Reading Instructional Goals for Older Children (4-12)
  - Enhanced Proactive Reading
  - Read Well

Findings from the Field and Research on CR literacy Instruction

- Engagement
- Retention
- Satisfaction
- Teachers reported to like the collaborative aspect of it
- Teachers reported to not trust outside consultants
- Teachers reported dismay with problem focused approaches
- Teachers reported improved skills and teaching efficacy

Let’s Try Adapting an Intervention

Repeated Reading Protocol

- Select literacy materials
- Preview the passage
- Student reads the passage twice with corrective feedback
- Student reads the passage a third time for time and progress monitoring
All to say, it’s an informed balancing act

- A guide for program fidelity and adaptation for prevention and interventions programs
- 12 steps for finding balance:
  - Define fidelity/adaptation balance
  - Assess community concerns and needs
  - Review the intervention
  - Examine theoretical principles and functional relationships with change
  - Selective tailored resources for implementation
  - Consider: keys to adaptation
  - Consider how to document adaptation
  - Consider program developer
  - Involve the community, family, and extended family members
  - Integrate all the prior steps into the plan
  - Socially adaptive adaptation issues into program evaluation
  - Conduct ongoing analysis of fidelity adaptation
  - Return years

The research-based “generic” modifications using Unity English:
- Predictable and consistent classroom management routines, asked to disseminate
- Weekly, midday, and end of day schedules on the board or website, to which the teacher refers frequently
- Engaging language and visuals to convey concepts and different text elements visually explored
- Additional opportunities for practice during the school day, after school, or at the weekends
- Bedtime and other routines (e.g., visual cues, pictures, and pictures portrayed in the classroom)
- Identifying, highlighting, and classifying different goals written and discussed with the student, providing a summary
- Effective and engaging activities in reading words, sentences, and stories to build automaticity and fluency
- Involving opportunities for extended interactions with teacher and peers
- Developing strategies based on language development, language development, and language development
- Targeting both content and English language objectives in every lesson
- Vicarious, teacher-led, independent, and cooperative strategies for student language development: adhering to standards and English language objectives
- Targeting both content and English language objectives in every lesson
- Vicarious, teacher-led, independent, and cooperative strategies for student language development: adhering to standards and English language objectives

Summary and Conclusions
- Great need for ecologically valid and culturally responsive practices
- One size does not fit all
- There are systematic frameworks for practice that are ready to be applied in school psychology
- Previous research has shown the adaptation process to be effective for improving outcomes
- Another reminder, that we must always look at everything we do within context and with multicultural lenses.
Resources

- National Center for Culturally Responsive Education Systems: http://www.nccc.georgetown.edu/
- Evidence-Based Intervention Network: http://evidencebasedinterventionnetwork.org/
- Center for Effective Collaboration and Practice: http://cecp.air.org/
- National Association of School Psychologists: http://www.naps.org/
- National Center for Culturally Competent Resources: http://nccc.georgetown.edu/

References